

MINUTES OF THE
STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD MEETING
JANUARY 19, 2007
MICHIGAN HISTORICAL CENTER

Board Members Present:

Scott Beld, Janese Chapman, Lynn Evans, Richard Harms, Alison (Kim) Hoagland (via videoconference), Elizabeth Knibbe, Carolyn Loeb, Jennifer Radcliff

Board Members Absent:

-none-

Staff Members Present:

Amy Arnold, Laura Ashlee, Robert Christensen, Brian Conway, Brian Grennell, Ted Grevstad-Nordbrock, Martha MacFarlane-Faes, Robbert McKay, Denise Sachau, Todd Walsh

Members of the Public Present:

Gordon D. Dorris, concerning Romeo Lions Club v. Romeo Historic District Commission and Village Trustees

James G. Johnston, concerning Romeo Lions Club v. Romeo Historic District Commission and Village Trustees

Rich Hensel, concerning Catalpas

Thom Golba, concerning Catalpas

Jenifer Golba, concerning Catalpas

Susan Kosky, concerning Davenport Hotel and St. Joseph Church and Shrine

Gladys Saborio, concerning Brick Walker Tavern and St. Joseph Church and Shrine

Kathie Glynn, concerning Irish Hills Towers

Maura Johnson, concerning Prudden Wheel Company Building

Caralee Swanberg, concerning Prudden Wheel Company Building

Bob Kellum, concerning Irish Hills Towers, St. Joseph Church and Shrine, Brick Walker Tavern and Davenport Hotel

Dan Cherry, concerning Irish Hills Towers, St. Joseph Church and Shrine, Brick Walker Tavern and Davenport Hotel

Bryon Richardson, concerning Irish Hills Towers, St. Joseph Church and Shrine, Brick Walker Tavern and Davenport Hotel

Approval of Agenda:

Harms motioned to amend agenda to move election of officers to after State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) staff reports.

Knibbe seconded motion.

Motion approved 8-0

Approval of minutes of September 15, 2006:

Loeb motioned to approve the minutes of Septembers 15, 2006

Harms seconded motion.

Motion approved 8-0

Staff Reports:

Brian Conway:

- Noted that the former meeting room in the Library of Michigan is being converted to library space for the Michigan law library, which is migrating back to the Library of Michigan.
- Asked Christensen for developments in securing meeting space for future meetings. Christensen stated that the Education Room will be used at the next meeting, and if that room is satisfactory it will be the permanent meeting space for Review Board meetings.
- The Michigan Historical Marker backlog has been eliminated due to the work of Ashlee and Grevstad-Nordbrock.
- The SHPO will submit another grant application to the National Park Service's Preserve America Fund. Arnold is currently writing the application. If funded, the grant will provide funds for consultants to prepare National Register (NR) nominations for Idlewild and House of David/Mary's City of David.
 - The Idlewild community has been previously listed in the National Register, however the current nomination, which was written in the 1970s, is severely deficient.
 - The Idlewild project is being undertaken in partnership with a Governor's Office initiative to assist this community in a planning effort to increase tourism.
 - The House of David/Mary's City of David project is being undertaken as part of the Cities of Promise program initiated by the Governor's Office.
- Under Section 106, the SHPO has been involved with Jean Klock Park in Benton Harbor, which is part of a larger redevelopment initiative in Benton Harbor.
 - A proposal has been submitted to place three holes of a proposed golf course within the boundaries of Jean Klock Park.
 - The SHPO insisted that the federal agency hire a consultant to evaluate the historic significance of the park. The park was thought to have been designed by Jens Jensen. However, the consultant's research did not confirm whether Jensen's design was carried out, and a SHPO staff visit didn't reveal any evidence to suggest the Jensen plan was ever implemented. SHPO is awaiting letter of eligibility opinion from the federal agency.
- The Michigan Lighthouse Assistance Program (MLAP) has been "on hold" over the past few months as the SHPO and the Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) negotiate a satisfactory bottomlands lease that would enable transfer of lighthouses to private groups. The negotiation process should be completed soon.
- The Ludington Pier Light, which is located on an Army Corps of Engineers (ACE) pier, is being transferred to a private group by the General Services Administration (GSA) without a DEQ license.
 - The position of the ACE and the GSA is that a bottomlands lease is not required. Though the DEQ disagrees with that position, the GSA is proceeding with the transfer.
 - Once this transfer is completed, it will open the door for transfer of all off shore lights in the state.
- The SHPO recently announced its FY07 MLAP grant awards.
 - The SHPO received more grant applications for a higher dollar amount than any previous year.
 - Grant requests totaled over \$290,000.
 - The SHPO funded eight grants for a total of \$233,000, which is the largest dollar amount ever funded.
- In AY06, the SHPO approved fifty-three state historic preservation tax credit projects with a total direct expenditure of approximately \$12,500,000, which had an economic impact of approximately \$26,700,000.
 - The SHPO collects an application fee from each state historic preservation tax credit application.
 - In AY06, the SHPO collected \$34,650, which assists in funding the administration of the program.

- In AY06, the SHPO approved forty-three federal or combined state-federal historic preservation tax credit projects.
 - The total direct investment of these projects equaled \$150,400,000, which provided an economic impact of \$332,300,000. This investment also created 3,836 jobs.
 - Radcliff asked if these numbers were available online, or if she could obtain a hard copy. Conway replied that he would supply her with a hard copy. Radcliff then asked if the totals could be broken down by county. Conway replied that the numbers were broken down by county and city.
- Noteworthy projects currently underway include:
 - Borden Creamery in Mount Pleasant. It has been a long battle. The building is owned by a private developer who is working with the city of Mount Pleasant. The city is scheduled to move their offices to the building when completed. Project has presented some preservation challenges, and the SHPO has had to compromise on a couple issues including the removal of the brick smokestack, and the removal of a historic water tower. Regardless, the project should be a great asset to the city.
 - Armory Arts project in Jackson is finally underway.
 - Book-Cadillac Hotel in Detroit is finally underway. The project has been controversial for the SHPO. After the approval of plans, and the sale of condominiums, the SHPO learned that plans called for the demolition of a historic building across the street from the hotel, and the subsequent construction of a parking ramp. The developer intended to construct a walkway from the parking ramp to the hotel, but the National Park Service issued a letter stating that the construction of a walkway would make the project ineligible for historic preservation tax credits.
- The City of Bay City and the City of Menominee are the two newest Certified Local Governments (CLG) in Michigan.
- One of the most noteworthy CLG grant projects was the completion of the Randolph Vocational School Educational Project, which was a collaboration between the Michigan Historic Preservation Network and the Detroit Historic Designation Advisory Board. The program brought in technicians and specialists in fields such as masonry repair, plaster repair, etc, as instructors for students in the vocational school.
- The SHPO received CLG grant applications totaling \$232,265, which is the largest request ever received. Unfortunately, the SHPO has only \$80,000 to award.
- The SHPO's special projects include the Preserve America Tourism Project for Southwest Michigan. Students have completed most of their work, and Arnold is working on finalizing context studies. The SHPO will be meeting with the Beachtown Association, which is the visitors bureau of the thirteen communities in the study area.
- The SHPO is hoping and planning to participate in the 75th anniversary celebration of the New Deal. Arnold is heading up the SHPO's effort in collecting information on Public Works Administration (PWA) projects in Michigan. The SHPO hopes to develop a context statement, a national register application, and a publication of some sort if funding can be obtained.
- The Michigan Historical Center (MHC) is also trying to divest itself of the Kalamazoo Water Tower, which is associated with the Kalamazoo State Hospital. The mission of the MHC in regards to state-owned property is to provide an educational or tourism experiences, and the tower, by its nature and location, prohibits either activity. However, the tower is an important landmark in Kalamazoo. The SHPO is investigating other ownership or partnership arrangements. The fear exists that if something happened to the tower, the SHPO does not have any funds for repair. The SHPO is hoping to work with the city of Kalamazoo to fund a condition assessment report through the CLG program. Previous restoration efforts include some work in the early 1970s, and roof repair in the 1990s. As of today, the SHPO is unsure of the overall condition of the tower. On January 30, 2007,

Conway will be participating in a public meeting with the city of Kalamazoo to determine public interest in the tower, and generate some ideas about its future.

- Conway and Lijewski will be speaking at the Old House Network Exposition in Kalamazoo.
- The MHPN annual conference will be held May 3-6 on Mackinac Island.
- A lighthouse conference is being planned by the Michigan Lighthouse Alliance to be held in Traverse City from June 13-15.

Barbara Mead

- Office of the State Archaeologist (OSA) has been working on some collections issues and outreach activities
- OSA has been increasingly busy with cultural resource reviews, but not related to Section 106. There seems to be a great appreciation among the general public and state agencies that cultural resource management can, in fact, be useful and desirable.
- The Kennecott Eagle Mining Project in Marquette County is generating a lot of controversy. The Department of Environmental Quality has requested that the mining company do a cultural resource study. As a result, an archaeological survey was done, and as anticipated, nothing in particular was found because of the remoteness of the site. The reason the site is not settled now is because there is nothing there to draw people, just as in prehistoric times. Local residents, however, have been using cultural resources as a means of continuing the controversy. Some residents have taken it upon themselves to try to find things in the woods. The mining company has been very cooperative in working with the OSA in investigating these reports.
- Schoolcraft Memorial Hospital Project in Schoolcraft County did not account for cultural resources soon enough in their planning. The property they purchased is the South Manistique town site, a national register eligible site of an 1880s/1890s sawmill town. Dean Anderson has met with the lawyers from the hospital. There is no place to locate the proposed hospital that will not directly impact most of the site. This project is still in discussion, and the hospital has to figure out what their next step will be. Mitigation would be extremely expensive for this project, and it is unlikely that the hospital would be able to afford it.
- The Department of Natural Resources (DNR) is continuing to increase inter-departmental cooperation with the OSA. OSA staff has reviewed over 1000 activities for DNR in the past quarter. Forest Management has appointed Rich Hausler as a cultural resource liaison. Hausler will be working with Mead on a plan to improve management of sites on state forest lands and to provide cultural resource advice to managers of privately owned forests. Interest in cultural resource management of state and private forests stems from the fact that a forest can now be registered as “sustainable forest” that incorporates state of the art management responsibilities. Owners of forests have to apply to international and national accreditation organizations, and one requirement is cultural resources management.
- Dean Anderson is on a planning committee for a meeting to be held in April. The Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) and the Federal Highway Administration (FHA) have organized the Michigan Intergovernmental Transportation Meeting to discuss transportation and cultural resource management issues with Michigan’s tribes.
- The Archaeological Conservancy is seeking projects in Michigan. The Archaeological Conservancy purchases archaeological properties and manage them in perpetuity. The organization is currently talking to owners of the Lion’s Prairie site in Ionia County. It is a national register eligible site that is listed on the state register. The site is owned by a trust managed by the children of the previous owners. Unfortunately, a neighbor wants to buy the site for gravel mining, and negotiations are still underway.
- This summer, OSA will be moving some of the collection to a new storage facility. Government records, archival material, and some of the historical museum’s collection will also be stored there.

- Collections are part of the permanent documentation of sites. As more and more sites are destroyed, more and more research depends on the collections that have been salvaged from these sites. In the past quarter, three universities (Wayne State University, Michigan State University, and Eastern Michigan University) have used OSA collections for research or teaching projects.
- The OSA was invited by the Michigan Department of Military Affairs (MDMA) to submit a proposal for funding to allow processing of some of their collections from Camp Grayling and Fort Custer. MDMA regulations come from the Department of Defense, which has set extremely rigorous standards for collections management. An application was submitted, but MDMA did not have the funds necessary to process the entire collection. However, OSA has received some money and will be able to take care of the portion of the collection in the worst shape.
- In October, over 500 people attended Michigan Archaeology Month. Over 300 people attended Archaeology Day at the Michigan Historical Center.
- At Thunder Bay National Marine Sanctuary (TBNMS), OSA has opened an exhibit documenting the Nordmeer, a German freighter that sank in 1966.
 - Radcliff asked if the artifacts found would be shared with the TBNMS. Mead replied that the TBNMS is jointly operated with the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), and that OSA has been moving all of their shipwreck artifacts to TBNMS. NOAA has already hired exhibit designers, and some artifacts will be held in open storage.
- Mead and Anderson participated in Michigan State University's American Indian Studies Symposium, *Archaeology and Indigenous Heritage Management Practices and Policies*. Anderson spoke to the state's role in cultural resource management. Mead was a luncheon roundtable participant.

Unfinished Business from 9/15/2006: Glen Ann Place, LLC, and Joseph Freed & Associates v. Ann Arbor Historic District Commission

Evans called a ten-minute recess in order to sign Final Decision and Order from previous meeting.

Election of Officers:

Nominating Committee nominated Carolyn Loeb as President and Alison Hoagland as Vice-President of the State Historic Preservation Office Review Board.

Acceptance of report and election of nominated officers moved by Harms

Seconded by Radcliff

Nominated slate elected 8-0

National Register Nominations

Site: Niles Downtown Historic District

Presented By: Christensen

Moved for Approval: Knibbe

Seconded: Chapman

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: A,C; g

Level of Significance: Local

Christensen noted that one property owner had submitted a letter in support of the nomination. Conway asked if the Kawneer name was located in a standard location on the siding material. Christensen stated the modern aluminum doors had the Kawneer name on them, but the older Kawneer products sometimes did not have any identifiers. Conway asked if Kawneer Company had a program that encouraged Niles business owners to use their products. Christensen stated that the company had an in-house design staff, and there is documentation of a few buildings whose storefronts were designed by that department, and their sales organization may have been set up to promote the design services.

Site: Chicago, Milwaukee & St. Paul Iron River Depot

Presented By: Christensen
Moved for Approval: Evans
Seconded: Harms
Vote: 8-0
Criteria: A, C

Level of Significance: Local

Christensen noted a letter of support received from Congressman Bart Stupak. Knibbe wondered if there was a standard design for such depots, as it resembles the depot in Ypsilanti. Christensen stated that many individual railroads seemed to have standard designs that they modified as needed.

Site: Cleveland Mine Engine House No. 3

Presented By: Christensen
Moved for Approval: Harms
Seconded: Chapman
Vote: 8-0
Criteria: A, C

Level of Significance: Local

Radcliff asked when the fencing around the property dates from. Christensen stated that he is unsure, because some of the complex is still owned by Cleveland Cliffs, and it is difficult to determine who owns what. Radcliff asked if there was any interest in completing national register nominations for other buildings owned by Cleveland Cliffs. Hoagland expressed concern about nominating one building when several more may be eligible. A member of the public stated that the fencing has been in place for years. Radcliff asked how the SHPO handles the question of listing one building when there is a collection that is eligible. Radcliff also asked how the SHPO decides if a building should be listed individually versus waiting for a district. Christensen replied that it is his preference to nominate all resources as a group, but in cases where there are individual resources that meet national register criteria, it is difficult to turn down the property owner. Conway stated that the general rule is whether or not a resource is eligible on its own. Chapman stated that there could never be a blanket solution to the question of listing resources individually or as a district. Knibbe stated that the SHPO and Review Board should always be clear why a resource is listed the way it is.

Site: Irish Hills Towers

Presented By: Glynn
Moved for Approval: Radcliff
Seconded: Harms
Vote: 8-0
Criteria: A

Level of Significance: Local

Conway asked if the interiors contained only stairways. Glynn replied that they did. Conway asked when the miniature golf course was added to the site. Glynn replied that it was added in 1987. Evans commented that there is a similar structure in St. Ignace. Glynn added that there is a listed observation tower in Indiana. Conway asked if the current owner had any plans for the tower. Glynn replied that she was unaware of any.

Site: St. Joseph Church and Shrine

Presented By: Saborio
Moved for Approval: Knibbe
Seconded: Evans
Vote: 8-0
Criteria: A, C; a, d

Level of Significance: Local

Saborio noted a letter of support from the Bishop of the Diocese of Lansing. Ashlee asked about the level of significance, considering the importance of the Rodriguez artwork. Saborio stated that Rodriguez's work

exists primarily in Texas, but there are seven states that have some of his work. Knibbe suggested developing an artistic context that would allow the nomination to be submitted under State-level significance. Arnold commented that if additional work was going to be done, that a National-level context be explored. Harms stated that if additional work was going to be done, then the nomination should be returned to the consultant for rewriting. Saborio stated she is in the process of writing an article for Michigan History Magazine that details Corona's work. Once she has completed writing that article, she felt that the information needed for State or National level significance would be available. Saborio stated that, at this time, she did not want to begin rewriting the nomination. Christensen stated that it was his opinion that the nomination, as it is, would meet State-level criteria. Harms stated that the nomination needed additional documentation to meet State-level criteria. Knibbe commented that the Irish Hills Towers nomination had better development of a state context than does this nomination. Harms suggested that the nomination be submitted at Local-level significance, and that the nomination could be revisited when additional documentation becomes available. Knibbe asked Saborio if she thought the article for Michigan History Magazine would be completed within six months. Saborio replied that it was possible. Knibbe then suggested that the nomination be held to allow for Saborio to add the information from her article. Chapman asked if the nomination was going to be held or submitted. Chapman added that if the nomination was going to be held for State-level documentation, then it would be prudent to develop a National-level context. Saborio stated that her clients were expecting the submission of a National Register nomination, and it is her preference to submit the nomination at Local-level significance, then revisit the level of significance at a later date. Conway recommended that the board consider submitting the nomination as is, with the understanding that the consultant work with SHPO staff in order to develop a State-level context. Saborio suggested submitting the nomination as is, and possibly developing a thematic nomination at a later date.

Site: Prudden Wheel Company Building

Presented By: Johnson

Moved for Approval: Harms

Seconded: Radcliff

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: A, B, C

Level of Significance: Local

Swanberg commented that the Prudden Wheel Company Building is under consideration for Platinum LEEDS certification.

Site: Brick Walker Tavern

Presented By: Saborio

Moved for Approval: Chapman

Seconded: Knibbe

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: A, B, C

Level of Significance: Local

Site: Davenport Hotel

Presented By: Kosky

Moved for Approval: Knibbe

Seconded: Evans

Vote: 7-0

Criteria: A

Level of Significance: Local

Radcliff asked about the word “probably” in reference to the 1860 date of construction. Kosky stated that a newspaper article noted a grand opening date of 1861. Kibbe suggested using “circa” instead of probably. Conway stated that the change would be brought to the attention of Christensen. Hoagland asked if the board should address the fact that the hotel is sided in vinyl. Conway stated that he was unaware that it was sided with vinyl, but that the form and features of the building are intact and the building is an important historic resources. Harms stated that the nomination is being submitted under Criterion A, and the question is whether or not the vinyl siding compromises the building’s eligibility under that criterion. Kosky commented that the owner is in the process of replacing the current vinyl with new vinyl and that she has seen the original wood siding underneath and it is still in good repair. Conway asked if the owner could be persuaded to restore the wood. Kosky clarified her earlier statement to say that owner is not replacing all of the vinyl, but only damaged pieces. Knibbe stated that submitting a nomination to the National Register for a building that is supposedly historic, yet covered in vinyl, is problematic. Due to time concerns, Conway suggested that Board resume discussion of this issue after the remaining nominations have been heard.

Site: Wendell P. and Harriet Rounds Robbins House

Presented By: Ashlee

Moved for Approval: Evans

Seconded: Harms

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: C

Level of Significance: Local

Golba stated that his future plans for the home include removing the cone-shaped roof on the tower of the house and restoring the widow’s walk that was originally part of the home.

Site: Fanckboner-Nichols Farmstead

Presented By: Ashlee

Moved for Approval: Knibbe

Seconded: Harms

Vote: 8-0

Criteria: A, C

Level of Significance: Local

Appeals:

Conway suggested the Board rearrange the agenda of the meeting for the sake of the members of the public present at the meeting. Conway further stated that the first issue the Board needs to address is whether they will accept additional testimony from members of the public.

Romeo Lions Club v. Romeo Historic District Commission and Village Trustees

Evans stated that the Board has a format in place for hearing appeals. Harms added that it has not been the practice of the Board to take comments at its meetings following the commenting opportunities already provided for through the hearings process. Harms suggested the Board adhere to the set precedent. The board agreed not to hear new testimony.

Harms moved adoption of the Proposal for Decision

Radcliff seconded adoption

Proposal for Decision adopted 7-0

Alison Hoagland excused herself from the meeting.

Davenport Hotel National Register Nomination

The Board resumed discussion of the Davenport Hotel.

Knibbe stated that the hotel is significant because of its relationship to the Irish Hills area as well as the one hundred years of travel down US-12. Knibbe added that if these elements were discussed in the nomination, it might mitigate the fact that the building is currently clad in vinyl. Christensen stated that he recommended the resource under Criterion A and not under Criterion C because of the integrity concerns under Architecture mentioned by the Board. Christensen further stated that he has visually inspected the building and feels it has enough integrity under Criterion A. Knibbe stated she is comfortable with submitting the nomination under Criterion A.

Historic District Committee Study Reports:

Knibbe suggested that, due to time concerns and the fact that the Board has previously read the reports, Arnold read the names of the reports instead of giving a full report, and if the Board members have any questions or concerns they can offer them then.

Detroit Leland Hotel Historic District, Detroit

Knibbe stated that the report incorrectly stated, “none of the other historic downtown Detroit hotels have survived.” The hotels have not survived as operating hotels, but the buildings are currently undergoing restoration.

Delhi Bridge Historic District, Washtenaw County

Harms asked about landscaping surrounding the bridge. Loeb noted a missing word in Arnold’s comments.

Northville Historic District Boundary Modification, Northville

Evans asked for clarification on the change in boundary.

Elimination of the Stephen Trowbridge House Historic District, Troy

Knibbe noted that the city officials have only offered information from the owner and have provided no corroborating evidence.

McDowell House Historic District, Royal Oak

The Board made no additional comments

Dates of Next Meetings:

May 11, 2007

September 14, 2007

Adjournment:

Knibbe moved that the meeting be adjourned.

Harms seconded.

Vote: 7-0.

The meeting adjourned at 1:07 p.m.

Prepared by T. Walsh